

#### BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Chevron Products Company,

Complainant,

vs.

Equilon Enterprises LLC, dba Shell Oil Products US, and Shell Trading (US) Company,

Defendants.

Case 05-12-004 (Filed December 5, 2005)

# ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE'S RULING GRANTING COMPLAINANT'S MOTION TO FILE UNDER SEAL

Pursuant to Rule 45 of the Rules of Practice and Procedure, Chevron Products Company (Chevron) moves to file under seal and maintain the confidentiality of its Reply to Opposition to Motion for Summary Adjudication. Chevron states that the reply is based on and quotes extensively from a number of exhibits that are subject to confidentiality agreements with the defendants and Chevron is obligated by those agreements to file its reply under seal.

There has been no opposition to this request.

The motion states grounds for a protective order under Pub. Util. Code § 583 and General Order 66-C and authority there cited. A public hearing on the motion is unnecessary.

236881 - 1 -

C.05-12-004 GEW/niz

Good cause appearing, IT IS RULED that:

1. The Motion for Authority to File Confidential Information Under Seal filed

by Chevron Products Company (Chevron) is granted to the extent set forth

below.

2. Chevron's Reply to Opposition to Motion for Summary Application shall

remain under seal for a period of two years from the date of this ruling, and

during that period shall not be made accessible or disclosed to anyone other than

Commission staff except (1) on the further order or ruling of the Commission, the

Assigned Commissioner, the assigned Administrative Law Judge (ALJ), or the

ALJ then designated as Law and Motion Judge (which order shall only be

entered after notice to Chevron and an opportunity to be heard), or (2) upon

execution of an appropriate nondisclosure agreement by all affected parties.

3. If Chevron believes that further protection of this information is needed

after two years, Chevron may file a motion stating the justification for further

withholding the information from public inspection, or for such other relief as

the Commission rules may then provide. This motion shall be filed no later than

30 days before the expiration of this protective order.

Dated June 19, 2006, at San Francisco, California.

/s/ GLEN WALKER

Glen Walker

Administrative Law Judge

- 2 -

### INFORMATION REGARDING SERVICE

I have provided notification of filing to the electronic mail addresses on the attached service list.

Upon confirmation of this document's acceptance for filing, I will cause a copy of the filed document to be served upon the service list to this proceeding by U.S. mail. The service list I will use to serve the copy of the filed document is current as of today's date.

Dated June 19, 2006, at San Francisco, California.



## SERVICE LIST in C.05-12-004 Page 1 of 2

#### \*\*\*\*\*\* APPEARANCES \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Melvin Goldstein GOLDSTEIN & ASSOCIATES, P.C. 1757 P STREET, N.W. WASHINGTON DC 20036 (202) 872-8740

mgoldstein@goldstein-law.com

For: TESORO REFINING AND MARKETING COMPANY

Bruce C. Paltenghi
Attorney At Law
GORDON WATRONS RYAN LANGLEY BRUNO & PAL
611 LAS JUNTAS STREET
MARTINEZ CA 94553
(925) 228-1400
bruce@gdwp.com
For: Tesoro Refining and Marketing Company

Erich Lichtblau Attorney At Law ORRICK HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE, LLP 405 HOWARD STREET SAN FRANCISCO CA 94105 (415) 773-5662

elichtblau@orrick.com For: Chevron Products Company

Joseph M. Malkin Attorney At Law ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP 405 HOWARD STREET SAN FRANCISCO CA 94105 (415) 773-5505 jmalkin@orrick.com For: Chevron Products Company

Candice S. Crookshank
Attorney At Law
ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE, LLP
405 HOWARD STREET
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94105
(415) 773-5700
cscrookshank@orrick.com

cscrookshank@orrick.com For: Chevron Products Company

Jeanne Mckinney Attorney At Law THELEN REID & PRIEST 101 SECOND STREET, SUITE 1800 SAN FRANCISCO CA 94105 (415) 369-7226 jmckinney@thelenreid.com

For: Equilon Enterprises LLC and Shell Trading (US) Company

Paul Lacourciere
Attorney At Law
THELEN REID & PRIEST
101 SECOND STREET, SUITE 1800
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94105
(415) 369-7601
placourciere@thelenreid.com
For: Equilon Enterprises LLC and Shell Trading (US) Company

#### \*\*\*\*\*\* STATE EMPLOYEE \*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Maurice Monson Energy Division AREA 4-A 505 VAN NESS AVE San Francisco CA 94102 (415) 703-3072 mdm@cpuc.ca.gov For: Energy Division

Glen Walker Administrative Law Judge Division RM. 5106 505 VAN NESS AVE San Francisco CA 94102 (415) 703-1232 gew@cpuc.ca.gov

#### \*\*\*\*\*\*\* INFORMATION ONLY \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Elizabeth Westby ALCANTAR & KAHL 1300 SW FIFTH AVE., SUITE 1750 PORTLAND OR 97201 (503) 402-8709 egw@a-klaw.com

Barron Dowling

Managing Attorney
300 CONCORD PLAZA DRIVE
SAN ANTONIO TX 78216
(210) 283-2415
bdowling@tsocorp.com

For: Tesoro Refining and Marketing Company

Kris Mira Senior Counsel 910 LOUISIANA, ROOM 1124 HOUSTON TX 77002 For: Equilon Enterprises LLC, dba Shell Oil Products US, and Shell Trading (US) Company

## SERVICE LIST in C.05-12-004 Page 2 of 2

Peter W. Hanschen MORRISON & FOERSTER, LLP 101 YGNACIO VALLEY ROAD, SUITE 450 WALNUT CREEK CA 94596-8130 (925) 295-3450 phanschen@mofo.com